

## **A STUDY ON INTRERNAL AND EXTERNAL ETHICAL PRACTICES FOLLOWED BY COOPERATIVE BANKS: EMPLOYEE AND CUSTOMER PERSPECTIVE**

**Dr. Kaushal A. Bhatt**

**Assistant Professor**

**Graduate School of Management Studies,**

**Gujarat Technological University**

**Email: ap1\_cgbs@gtu.edu.in**

**Dr. Kinjal Bhatt**

**Assistant Professor**

**Shri V M Mehta Municipal Arts and  
Commerce College, Saurashtra University**

**Email: bhattkinjalr@gtu.edu.in**

### **ABSTRACT:**

Banks formed on the principle of co-operation are called co-operative banks. The organization in which I have taken the industrial training is Nawanagar Co-operative Bank Ltd., which is one of leading Co-operative banks in Jamnagar city. Nawanagar Co-operative Bank Ltd. provides various types of services to the customers. The services provided by the bank will be discussed later in the project.

**Ethics**, also known as moral philosophy, is a branch of philosophy that addresses questions about morality—that is, concepts such as good and evil, right and wrong, virtue and vice, justice, etc. In internal ethics we have covered all the ethical practices that are to be followed by Bank. In external ethics we had an interaction with the customers of all the co-operative banks in order to get the idea whether the bank follows all the ethical practices or not.

As this topic ethics in Co-operative Banks is not done before by anyone so we have done the primary data collection through questionnaire and it has been filled up by the 100 staff among all the co-operative banks and also 100 customers of all eight co-operative banks in order to come up with the finding and conclusion about which banks have been found ethical and which banks are lacking behind in following ethical practices.

It is found that Bank investment pattern is good but still the proportion of investment in RBI and other co-operative is 1:1. It is also found that all the banks running on the ethical path as no bank is investing in anti-social activities. As the study has been done on all the co-operative banks it is found that they are working on time basis and also on need basis as a part of CRM activity.

### **Keywords:**

**Ethics, Cooperative Banks, Employee, Customer, CRM**

## **1. INTRODUCTION**

**Banking in India** originated in the first decade of 18<sup>th</sup> century with The General Bank of India coming into existence in 1786. This was followed by Bank of Hindustan. Both these bank are now defunct. The oldest bank in existence in India is the State Bank of India being established as “The Bank of Bengal” in Calcutta in June 1806. A couple of decade later foreign bank like credit Lyonnais started their Calcutta operation in the 1850s. At that point of time, Calcutta was the most active trading port, mainly due to the trade of British Empire, and due to which banking activity took roots there and prospered. The first fully India owned bank was the Allahabad Bank, which was established in 1865.

By the 1900s, the market expanded with the establishment of bank such as Punjab National Bank, in 1895 in Lahore and Bank of India, in 1906, in Mumbai- both of which were founded under private ownership.

The Reserve Bank of India formally took on the responsibility of regulating the India banking sector from 1935. After India's independence in 1947, the Reserve Bank was nationalized and given broader powers.

## 2. REVIEW OF LITERATURE

### *“Ethical issues and attitude in the Turkish banking sector” by Hortacsu, Ayfer, Ozkan Gunay, E. Nur*

This study concentrates on the ethical issues and conditions prevailing in the Turkish banking environment. A self-administered mail survey was conducted with 554 top bank managers in Turkey. Scenarios that were developed after a pilot study were factor analyzed. The objective of the study was to identify ethics related organizational, cognitive and affective dimensions that are likely to affect perceptions of bank managers in interpreting the eight factors and the remaining four scenarios. The findings indicate a consensus on ethical sensitivity among the Turkish bank managers. The Banks Association of Turkey has a code of ethics that favorably influences the banks, and the regulatory agency (BRSA) is perceived to enhance the ethical values in the sector. An optimistic view maybe to interpret the ethical banking climate as a desirable after effect of the banking crisis and the regulatory intervention. This development may indicate a deterrence-based shift to a more virtuous Turkish banking sector.

### **“Banking Ethics” by Elisabeth Paulet, (ESCEM, Poitiers, France)**

Since the 1980s, the global financial system has faced several crises that have led regulators to consider new conjectural and structured problems. These crises have led economists and financial analysts to the following conclusions. First of all, systemic risk has increased during the last 30 years, which had led regulators to devise rules to evaluate information more efficiently. Second, the recent collapse of stock markets despite the national rescue measures shows the importance of preventative procedures. The third point is that aggressive capitalism has demonstrated its limits. The aim of this paper is to show that regulation is a necessary but not sufficient condition to ensure the efficiency of banking institutions, financial markets and the management of companies. Through the analysis of the Swiss banking sector, the paper provides an insight for banks to satisfy social pressure on more ethical behavior. This case could be an example for another functioning for financial institutions. By refocusing on their core business, banking institutions will be capable of realizing profit and creating value for the community.

## 3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

### 3.1 Statement of Problem:

Ethics have taken place in all the fields like in accounting, finance, hospital, business, and schools. Ethics is such a concept which has led to great success and also benefited both the business as well as customers. Ethics acts as an arm for the protection. And co-operative banks is increasing their importance day by day. They run with the motive of customers' satisfaction and cooperation in the staff. But along with that ethics is also needed to build their place in it to go hand in hand with the customer satisfaction. Ethics is a developing topic for the banking sector. And through this research bank can also run their business through ethics .That's why the statement of problem is on the topic. “A STUDY ON INTRERNAL AND EXTERNAL ETHICAL PRACTICES FOLLOWED BY COOPERATIVE BANKS: EMPLOYEE AND CUSTOMER PERSPECTIVE.”

**3.2 Objectives of the Study:****A) PRIMARY OBJETIVES**

To analyze the internal and external ethical practices followed by Cooperative Banks in Jamnagar city.

**B) SECONDARY OBJECTIVES**

1. To measure the Designation wise and Bank wise internal ethical practices of all the Employees of Cooperative Banks in Jamnagar city
2. To check the ethical practices from viewpoint of staff, management and customers of each Co-operative Banks.
3. To check the hidden unethical practices that are followed in all Cooperative Banks at Jamnagar city.
4. To check the fairness and transparency of all Cooperative Banks at Jamnagar city.
5. To check how far the ethics is been followed in Co-operative Banks
6. To know where the bank uses the public's deposit.

**3.3 SCOPE OF STUDY:**

Geographical scope is limited to eight co-operative banks in Jamnagar city. In internal ethics age group of staff is taken between 18 to 60 and for the external ethics our scope is limited to the age of 75. Our study includes all the employees and customers but excluded shareholders and B.O.D. In all the co-operative banks the major proportion of customers are having the following accounts: Current, Savings, Overdraft, Cash credit. So our scope is limited to above four accounts only.

**3.4 DATA COLLECTION AND SAMPLING METHOD:**

In this research study, the data has been collected through Structured Questionnaire and also had the conversation with the customers in all co-operative banks.

**3.5 POPULATION AND SAMPLE SIZE:**

All eight Cooperative Banks in Jamnagar city would formulate Population for this research and conveniently 100 Employees for internal ethics and 100 customers from all the Cooperative Banks at Jamnagar city for external ethics have been selected as sample for this study.

**3.6 TOOLS AND TECHNIQUES OF ANALYSIS:**

Current study is based on primary data so collected data have been analyzed in two sections. Section – A is for Graphical Analysis and Section – B is for Hypothesis testing.

For Section – A: Charts have been used for the purpose of analysis. For Section – B: statistical tools like Average and Two Way ANOVA test have been used for testing of hypothesis. Here, Section – A is not presented because it is related only with graphs.

**3.7 HYPOTHESIS OF THE STUDY:****Internal ethics**

**H0:** There is no significant difference within the designation of the staff of all the Cooperative banks and their pattern of doing routine operation.

**H0:** There is no significant difference within all co-operative banks and the base with which they do their routine operations

**H0:** There is no significant difference within the designation of all the staff of all co-operative banks and the training they get before and after they join the bank.

**H0:** There is no significant difference within all co-operative banks and the funds where they are investing

**H0:** There is no significant difference within the designation of all the staff of all co-operative banks and working overtime.

**H0:** There is no significant difference within the designation of all the staff of all co-operative banks and the partiality that they have experienced among staff.

### **External**

**H0:** There is no significance difference between the types of accounts and their passing of cheques even if there is in-sufficient balance in the customer's account.

**H0:** There is no significance difference between the co-operative banks in Jamnagar city and passing of the cheques of the accounts with insufficient balance

**H0:** There is no significance difference between all co-operative banks and the completion of KYC of their customers.

**H0:** There is no significance difference between all co-operative bank and their informing to customer about charging the penalties them.

### **3.8 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY:**

- Many banks were not disclosing their proportion of investment pattern.
- As many customers were not aware about the KYC so it was difficult to explain them.
- Most of the respondents were not aware about the ethics so it was difficult to make them fill the questionnaire.
- Many customers didn't answer some questions so it was becoming difficult in analyzing.
- In these co-operative banks most of the customers were accountants so the proper information about the account holder was not able to get.

## **4. DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION**

### **(A) INTERNAL ETHICS:-**

#### **4.1. Designation wise type of basis for carrying out routine operations.**

**Table No. 1**

<b>Designation</b>	<b>Time Basis</b>	<b>Need Basis</b>	<b>Both</b>
Manager	2	2	8
Clerk	6	9	29
Officer	10	9	14
Sub Staff	0	0	11
Total	18	20	62

From the above table, we can conclude that mostly officers do their job or routine operations till the working hours. While on need basis that is doing their job even after the working hours is over, there also

officers are the one who are doing their job on need basis if their work is pending then only. Lastly clerks are the one who is doing the routine operation with the combination of both time and need basis.

**H<sub>0</sub>:** There is no significant difference within the designation of the staff of all the Cooperative banks and their pattern of doing routine operation.

**Table No. 2**  
**One Way ANOVA Analysis**

Source of Variation	SS	Df	MS	F	F crit
Between designation	263.3333	3	87.77778	1.628027	4.066181
Within designation	431.3333	8	53.91667		
Total	694.6667	11			

Here the ANOVA table with the d.f. (3, 8) and at 5% level of significance,  $F_c$  is 1.628027 and  $F_t$  is 4.066181 so as  $F_c$  is lower than  $F_t$ . So null hypothesis is accepted. Therefore there is no significance within the designation of all the staff of all the Cooperative banks and their pattern of doing their routine operations.

#### 4.2. Bank wise pattern of doing the routine operation

**Table No. 3**

Name of the Bank	Pattern of work			
	Time Basis	Need Basis	Both	Total
Rajkot Nagrik Bank	3	1	5	9
Co. Co. Bank	3	4	5	12
J.P Bank	2	0	8	10
Jamnagar Mahila Sahakari Bank	1	2	7	10
Raj Bank Ltd	1	0	9	10
Nawanagar Co-operative Bank	5	8	13	26
J.D Co-operative Bank	2	7	4	13
Vardhaman Co-operative Bank	1	1	8	10

As the co-operative name it-self suggests to provide services to the customers with co-operation. As all the private and public banks works on time basis and not on need basis. As we can see from the above table that all the co-operative banks in Jamnagar works on need basis and not on time basis so as to maintain customer relationship.

**H<sub>0</sub>:** There is no significant difference within all co-operative banks and the base with which they do their routine operations

**Table No.4**  
**One Way ANOVA Analysis**

Source of Variation	SS	Df	MS	F	F crit
Between banks	125.0833	2	62.54167	9.364528	3.4668
Within banks	140.25	21	6.678571		
Total	265.3333	23			

Here the ANOVA table with the d.f. (2, 21) and at 5% level of significance,  $F_c$  is 9.364528 and  $F_t$  is 3.4668 As  $F_c$  is higher than  $F_t$ . So null hypothesis is rejected therefore it can be said that there is significance difference within all co-operative banks and the base with which they do their routine operations.

**4.3. Designation of staff wise training given by the bank.****Table No. 5**

Designation	Always	Sometimes	Never	Total
Manager	6	5	0	11
Clerk	5	25	16	46
Officer	5	15	11	31
Sub Staff	1	7	4	12

Training is important to provide to the staff people in order to impart the technique, skills, knowledge related to the job. So bank manager should organize training programme for their staff. Manager is the main key to the bank he is given training always, while clerks are been provided not regularly but at the time of need. Officers and sub staff people are been given training as per the need.

**H<sub>0</sub>:** There is no significant difference within the designation of all the staff of all co-operative banks and the training they get before and after they join the bank.

**Table No. 6****ANOVA table of Designation of staff wise training given by the bank.**

Source of Variation	SS	Df	MS	F	F crit
Between designation	155.1666667	2	77.58333333	1.680505415	4.256494729
Within designation	415.5	9	46.16666667		
Total	570.6666667	11			

Here the ANOVA table with the d.f. (2, 9) and at 5% level of significance, F<sub>c</sub> is 1.680505415 and F<sub>t</sub> is 4.256494729. As F<sub>c</sub> is lower than F<sub>t</sub>. So null hypothesis is accepted that shows that there is no significance within designation of all the staff of all the Cooperative banks and the training they get before and after they join the bank.

**4.4. Bank wise investing the funds.****Table No.7**

Bank Name	RBI	Anti-Social Business	Private Banks	Govt. Securities	Nationalized Banks	Other Co-operative Banks
Rajkot Nagrik	3	0	0	4	4	3
Co. Co. Bank	4	0	2	10	9	5
J. P Bank	0	0	2	s3	2	2
Mahila Sahakari	4	0	0	6	3	3
Raj Bank	0	0	0	0	0	0

NCBL	7	0	5	12	15	6
J.D Bank	6	0	2	6	6	1
Vardhaman Bank	1	0	1	5	4	4
Total	25	0	12	46	43	24

In order to judge the true ethical practices in banks, the main source is to find out where the bank is investing the funds which they have got from the customer's deposit. We can see that all the banks invest most of the deposits in government securities, nationalized banks and also RBI. As compared to government securities and nationalized banks invest in RBI is low but it is advisable to invest more in RBI.

**H<sub>0</sub>:** There is no significant difference within all co-operative banks and the funds where they are investing

**Table No.8**

ANOVA table of all co-operative banks and the funds where they are investing

Source of Variation	SS	df	MS	F	F crit
Between banks	218.5833333	7	31.22619048	3.777361751	2.249024326
Within banks	330.6666667	40	8.266666667		
Total	549.25	47			

Here the ANOVA table with the df (7, 40) and at 5% level of significance,  $F_c$  is 3.777361751 and  $F_t$  is 2.249024326 higher than  $F_t$ , so null hypothesis gets rejected Therefore there is significant difference within all co-operative banks and the funds where they are investing.

#### 4.5. Designation of staff and their working overtime.

**Table No. 9**

Designation	Yes	No
Manager	10	2
Clerk	40	7
Officer	23	8
Sub Staff	8	2
Total	81	19

As motivation is very much necessary in every organization to get work done from so as to get work done from workers and make them work overtime they must be given some extra benefits so they motivated to do work overtime. In most of the organization people are been told to work overtime but they are been paid. In all these banks all the designation of staff are doing overtime and are not been paid for it. This is what an unethical practice mean.

**H<sub>0</sub>:** There is no significant difference within the designation of all the staff of all co-operative banks and working overtime.

**Table No.10****ANOVA table of Designation of staff and their working overtime**

Source of Variation	SS	Df	MS	F	F crit
Between designation	480.5	1	480.5	4.217996	5.987378
Within designation	683.5	6	113.9167		
Total	1164	7			

Here the ANOVA table with the d.f. (1, 6) and at 5% level of significance,  $F_c$  is 4.217996 and  $F_t$  is 5.987378 As  $F_c$  is lower than  $F_t$ . So, null hypothesis is accepted and that shows that there is no significance within designate on of all the staff of all the Cooperative banks and working overtime.

#### 4.6. Designation of all the members of all the Co-operative Banks and the Partiality that they have experienced among staff

**Table No.11**

Designation	Always	Sometimes	Never
Manager	3	1	7
Clerk	9	20	13
Officer	3	14	13
Sub Staff	2	8	0
Total	17	43	39

If in the banks or in organization, staff is not treated well then level of dissatisfaction increases and this affects the work. So as a part of ethical practices, bank should see to it that their staff should not be treated badly or no biasness should be done among staff.

From all the Co-operative banks highest proportion with twenty clerks have experienced partiality sometimes not always and this should be removed by the all the members working in the bank.

**H<sub>0</sub>:** There is no significant difference within the designation of all the staff of all co-operative banks and the partiality that they have experienced among staff.

**Table No.12**

#### ANOVA table of Designation of all the staff of all the Co-operative Banks and the partiality that they have experienced among staff.

Source of Variation	SS	Df	MS	F	F crit
Between designation	324.9167	3	108.3056	4.303532	4.066181
Within designation	201.3333	8	25.16667		
Total	526.25	11			

Here the ANOVA table with the df (3, 8) and at 5% level of significance,  $F_c$  is 4.303532 and  $F_t$  is 4.066181 as  $F_c$  is higher than  $F_t$  it comes to the conclusion that null hypothesis is rejected and there is significant difference within the designation of all the staff and sub staff of all co-operative banks and partiality that they have experienced among staff.

**(B)EXTERNAL ETHICS****4.7. Accounts wise passing of cheques with insufficient balance****Table No.13**

Type of Account	Yes	No
Current	23	9
Cash Credit	13	6
Savings	17	21
Over Draft	6	5
Total	59	41

We can see that cheques of current accounts i.e. (23) are passed more even if there is insufficient balance in their account because of the daily routine transactions and less cheques are passed of savings i.e. (17) because due less interaction and transactions made by customers they have less trust on them. So it is unethical practices done by bank. As passing such cheques of high amount is risky for bank. So bank must not do such things in order to maintain relationship with customer.

**Ho:** There is no significance difference between the types of accounts and their passing of cheques even if there is in-sufficient balance in the customer's account.

**Table No.14****ANOVA table of account wise passing of cheques**

Source of Variation	SS	Df	MS	F	F crit
Between the types of accounts	225	3	75	2.290076	6.591382117
Within the types of accounts	131	4	32.75		
Total	356	7			

Here in the ANOVA table with the  $df = (3, 4)$  at 5% level of significance,  $F_c$  is 2.290076 and  $F_t$  is 6.591382117. As  $F_c$  is lower than  $F_t$  so null hypothesis is accepted. Therefore, there is no significance difference between the types of accounts and their passing of cheques even if there is in-sufficient balance in the customer's account

**4.8. Bank wise passing of cheques of those accounts which have insufficient balance****Table No.15**

Bank Name	Yes	No
Nawanagar Co-operative Bank	7	5
Co. Co. Bank Ltd.	8	9
Mahila Sahakari Bank Ltd.	9	6

Jamnagar Peoples Bank	9	4
Vardhaman Bank	5	10
Raj Bank	4	8
Rajkot Nagrik Ltd.	7	5
Jamnagar District Bank	1	3

As we are doing the comparison between the passing of cheques of insufficient balance in the customer account and the bank so from the above table we can say that more no. of cheques are passed by Jamnagar Mahila Sahakari bank and Jamnagar peoples bank. Ratio of passing of cheques is more than the rejecting the cheques. It should not be done it is risky for bank if they pass such cheques and if bank is not able to get that amount than it will decrease the profit of the bank.

**Ho:** There is no significance difference between the co-operative banks regarding passing of the cheques having insufficient balance

#### **ANOVA table of bank wise passing of cheques of those account which have insufficient balance**

**Table No.16**

Source of Variation	SS	Df	MS	F	F crit
Between Banks	53	7	7.571429	1.376623	3.500464
Within Banks	44	8	5.5		
Total	97	15			

Here in the ANOVA table with the  $df = (7, 8)$  at 5% level of significance  $F_c$  is 1.376623 and  $F_t$  is 3.500464. As  $F_c$  is lower than  $F_t$  so null hypothesis is accepted. There, there is no significance difference between bank wise passing of cheques with insufficient balance in the account.

#### **4.9. Bank wise completion of KYC of their customers.**

**Table No.17**

Bank Name	Yes	No
Nawanagar Bank	8	4
Commercial Co-operative	11	5
Mahila Sahakari Bank Ltd.	5	10
Jamnagar Peoples Bank	5	8
Vardhaman Bank	10	5
Raj Bank	6	6
Rajkot Nagrik Bank Ltd.	10	2
Jamnagar District Bank	3	2

As we are doing comparison of different co-operative banks and the no. of customers whose KYC is complete. We can compare that how many customers are aware of KYC and from that how many of them KYC is complete. So we can see that highest no of customers who are aware of KYC is in co-co bank i.e. 13 customers and from that 11 customers KYC is complete and the bank whose customers are aware about the KYC and KYC is not complete is J.P. bank i.e. 7 are aware of KYC and out of that only 2 of them KYC is complete. So we can say that J.P. bank is not ethical as it is necessary for the bank to know their customers means that they are not misusing the facility given by bank. It is to know from where they are getting money.

**Ho:** There is no significance difference between all co-operative banks and the completion of KYC of their customers.

**Table No.18**  
**ANOVA table of Bank wise completion of KYC of their customers**

Source of Variation	SS	df	MS	F	F crit
Between Bank	12.25	1	12.25	1.548532731	4.60011
Within Bank	110.75	14	7.9107143		
Total	123	15			

Here in the ANOVA table with the  $df = (1, 14)$  at 5% level of significance  $F_c$  is 1.54853271 and  $F_t$  is 4.60011. As  $F_c$  is lower than  $F_t$  so null hypothesis is accepted. Therefore there is no significance difference between all co-operative and the completion of KYC of their customers.

#### 4.10. Bank wise informing of charging of penalties from customers.

**Table No.19**

Bank Name	Yes	No
Nawanagar Co-operative	9	4
Commercial Co-operative	5	8
Mahila Sahakari Bank Ltd.	8	8
Jamnagar Peoples Bank	9	5
Vardhaman Bank	7	8
Raj Bank	8	5
Rajkot Nagrik Bank Ltd.	4	8
Jamnagar District Bank	2	3

As it will be unethical if the bank will not inform about their charging penalties to customers. So from the above table we see that the highest no. of customers who are not informed about charging the penalties from their customers is in Co-Co bank, Jamnagar Mahila Sahakari Ban, Vardhaman Bank and Rajkot Nagrik Bank and the banks who inform about charging penalties from customer is NCBL and J.P. Bank.

**Ho:** There is no significance difference between all co-operative bank and their informing to customer about charging the penalties them.

**Table No.20****ANOVA table of bank wise informing to their customers about charging penalties**

Source of Variation	SS	df	MS	F	F crit
Between Bank	38.9375	7	5.5625	1.15584416	3.500464
Within Bank	38.5	8	4.8125		
Total	77.4375	15			

Here in the ANOVA table with the  $df = (7, 8)$  at 5% level of significance  $F_c$  is 1.15584416 and  $F_t$  is 3.500464. As  $F_c$  is lower than  $F_t$  so null hypothesis is accepted. Therefore, there is no significance difference between bank and their informing to the customers about charging their penalties.

## 5. FINDINGS OF THE STUDY:

- It is found that the routine operation of the bank is not check regularly by the top committees.
- In all the co-operative banks there is no gender discrimination in the pay rates which is good and also ethical.
- It is found that Bank investment pattern is good but still the proportion of investment in RBI and other co-operative is 1:1
- It is also found that all the banks running on the ethical path as no bank is investing in anti-social activities.
- All the co-operative banks have not disclosed the proportion of their investment.
- Regarding the adhesive stamp most of the banks are printing the stamp of other banks.
- It is also found that almost all the banks employees are working overtime but they are not being paid for it.
- As the study has been done on all the co-operative banks it is found that they are working on time basis and also on need basis as a part of CRM activity.
- It is found that major customers are having current account in the bank for doing their routine operation.
- As a part of ethical practices bank is informing about the new schemes to the customers and mostly they do this through direct contact.
- Cheques of those accounts which are having in-sufficient balance which are not to be passed but these banks are passing which is unethical.
- It is found that most of the customers are aware about the KYC but bank has not done their responsibility of completing the customers KYC.
- After sanctioning the loan to the customer banks never take visit to the place of customer for checking about utilization of loan amount

## 6. CONCLUSION

It can be concluded that these eight Co-operative banks are following ethics but they give more importance to the co-operation. Out of all the eight co-operative banks, Nawanagar co-operative Banks is found to be ethical in all the questions asked them such as they are working on time basis which means they are following the rules and laws made for working hours, they are investing most of the funds in RBI and government securities as it is the safest place to invest the customers deposits while in Raj Co-operative

Banks to committees is checking the work of staff regularly which can protect bank as well as customers from fraud. But one thing to criticize about every bank is this that they are not sharing or telling to the staff about where the bank is investing their funds. But yes all the Cooperative banks are ethical in investing as none of the banks are investing in anti-social business which is very harmful for the customer's funds. Mostly in all the co-operative banks, the staff is working overtime and employees are not being paid for it. And especially clerks are the one who are most of the time doing overtime and they are also experiencing partiality among staff which is not fit to be ethical. About the gender discrimination too, all the eight banks are giving equal pay rates to both the gender people. At last it can be said in few words that the no bank is fully on the ethical path as their motto is service with co-operation. As we know that both cannot be run together therefore these Cooperatives banks can be called as ethical banks but due to CRM activities and their relation with the customer makes them behind from the US Co-operative Banks and Private Banks.

## 7. REFERENCES

1. Aristotle, and Joe Sachs. *Nicomachean Ethics*; *Nicomachean Ethics*. English. Newbury, Massachusetts: Focus Pub. /R. Pullins, 2002.
2. Ben Cohen and Mal Warwick, *Values-Driven Business*, ISBN 1-57675-358-1
3. Bruyn, S. T. "The Moral Economy." *Review of Social Economy* 57.1 (1999): 25–46.
4. Christopher J. Cowton & Paul Thompson, "Do Codes Make a Difference? The Case of Bank Lending and the Environment", *Journal of Business Ethics*, v.24, n.2 (March 2000)
5. Coro Strandberg. (2005). Sustainability finance study: A study of best practices, standards and trends in corporate social responsibility
6. Cowton, C. J., and P. Thompson. "Do Codes make a Difference? The Case of Bank Lending and the Environment." *Journal of Business Ethics* 24.2 (2000): 165–178.
7. Fairbairn, B., et al. *Credit Unions and Community Economic Development*. Centre for the Study of Co-operatives, University of Saskatchewan, 1997.
8. Green, C. F. "Business Ethics in Banking." *Journal of Business Ethics* 8.8 (1989): 631–634.
9. Greenspan, Alan, "Gold and Economic Freedom," Ayn Rand — *Capitalism: The Unknown Ideal*, 96. *Gold Standard*, Ayn Rand Lexicon.
10. Greenspan, Alan, "Gold and Economic Freedom," *Capitalism: The Unknown Ideal*, 101. *Inflation*, Ayn Rand Lexicon.
11. Harvey, B. "Ethical Banking: The Case of the Co-Operative Bank." *Journal of Business Ethics* 14.12 (1995): 1005–1013.
12. Jeucken, M. "Banking and sustainability—slow Starters are Gaining Pace." *Ethical Corporation Magazine* 11 (2002): 44–48.
13. Jeucken, M. H., and J. J. Bouma. "The Changing Environment of Banks." *GREENER MANAGEMENT INTERNATIONAL* (1999): 21–35.
14. Kant, Immanuel, and H. J. Paton. *The Moral Law: [Or] Kant's Groundwork of the Metaphysic of Morals*. ed. London: Hutchinson University Library, 1956.
15. Mill, John Stuart, and Oskar Piest, eds. *Utilitarianism*. Indianapolis; New York: Bobbs-Merrill, 1957.
16. Missbach, A. "The Equator Principles: Drawing the Line for Socially Responsible Banks? An Interim Review from an NGO Perspective." *Development* 47.3 (2004): 78–84.
17. Paul Thompsn & Christopher J. Cowton, "Bringing the Environment into Bank Lending: Implications for Environmental Reporting", *British Accounting Review*, v.36, n.2, pp. 197–218 (June 2004).

18. Rand, Ayn, "America's Persecuted Minority: Big Business," Capitalism: The Unknown Ideal, 48. Free Market, Ayn Rand Lexicon.
19. Rand, Ayn, "America's Persecuted Minority: Big Business," Capitalism: The Unknown Ideal, 47. Free Market, Ayn Rand Lexicon.
20. Rand, Ayn, "Moral Inflation," The Ayn Rand Letter, III, 12, 1. Inflation, Ayn Rand Lexicon.
21. Rand, Ayn, "The Objectivist Ethics", The Virtue of Selfishness, 23. Morality, Ayn Rand Lexicon.
22. Rand, Ayn, "Who Will Protect Us from Our Protectors?" The Objectivist Newsletter, May 1962, 18. Inflation, Ayn Rand Lexicon.